DOI: 10.1111/ene.14786

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

european journal of neurology

Association between neuropathy and B-vitamins: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Johannes Stein^{1,2} | Juergen Geisel² | Rima Obeid²

¹Saarland University, Saarbrucken, Germany

²Department of Clinical Chemistry and Laboratory Medicine, Saarland University Hospital, Homburg, Germany

Correspondence

Rima Obeid, Department of Clinical Chemistry and Laboratory Medicine, Saarland University, Medical School, D-66421 Homburg/Saar, Germany. Email: rima.obeid@uks.eu

Abstract

Background: Peripheral neuropathy (PN) is common in patients with diseases that are in turn associated with deficiency of the B-vitamins, and vitamin treatment has shown mixed results.

Methods: This systematic review and meta-analysis studied the association between PN/ pain and B-vitamin biomarkers and investigated whether vitamin treatment can ameliorate the symptoms. PubMed and Web of Science were searched according to the study protocol.

Results: A total of 46 observational and seven interventional studies were identified and included in the data synthesis. The presence of PN was associated with lowered B12 levels (pooled estimate [95% CIs] = 1.51 [1.23–1.84], n = 34, Cochran Q Test $l^2 = 43.3\%$, p = 0.003) and elevated methylmalonic acid (2.53 [1.39–4.60], n = 9, $l^2 = 63.8\%$, p = 0.005) and homocysteine (3.48 [2.01–6.04], n = 15, $l^2 = 70.6\%$, p < 0.001). B12 treatment (vs. the comparators) showed a non-significant association with symptom improvement (1.36 (0.66–2.79), n = 4, $l^2 = 28.9\%$). Treatment with B1 was associated with a significant improvement in symptoms (5.34 [1.87–15.19], n = 3, $l^2 = 64.6\%$, p = 0.059). Analysis of seven trials combined showed a non-significant higher odds ratio for improvement under treatment with the B-vitamins (2.58 [0.98–6.79], $l^2 = 80.0\%$, p < 0.001).

Conclusions: PN is associated with lowered plasma vitamin B12 and elevated methylmalonic acid and homocysteine. Overall, interventional studies have suggested that Bvitamins could improve symptoms of PN. Available trials have limitations and generally did not investigate vitamin status prior to treatment. Well-designed studies, especially in non-diabetes PN, are needed. This meta-analysis is registered at PROSPERO (ID: CRD42020144917).

KEYWORDS

diabetes, homocysteine, peripheral neuropathy, vitamin B1, vitamin B12, vitamin B6, vitamin deficiency

Responsible for statistical analyses and data integrity: J. Stein and R. Obeid

This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution NonCommercial License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited and is not used for commercial purposes. © 2021 The Authors. *European Journal of Neurology* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of European Academy of Neurology

INTRODUCTION

Peripheral neuropathy (PN) is generalized nerve damage of the peripheral nerve system. The age-standardized prevalence of PN in the general population is 9.4%.¹ The etiology of PN is not well characterized. Approximately 31% of patients with PN have diabetes and 46% of neuropathies are idiopathic.¹

Vitamin B12 deficiency causes spinal cord lesion or subacute combined degeneration where a demyelination process leads to decay of the myelin sheath in the dorsal and lateral columns.^{2,3} In older patients with Parkinson's disease, neuropathy could be due to levodopa (L-dopa) treatment that causes vitamin B12 deficiency. Also, toxins such as alcohol and viral infections are associated with vitamin B12 deficiency and neuropathy.^{2,3} Thus, vitamin B12 deficiency could be causally related to PN. The mechanisms could involve hypomethylation, phospholipid metabolism, and neurotoxic effects of homocysteine.⁴

Diagnosis of PN and differential diagnosis of similar disorders (i.e., myelopathy) ⁵ is challenging. Disease history and symptoms such as numbness, parenthesis, pain, and/or dysesthesias provide important clues to the diagnosis. The diagnosis relies on medical history, symptoms, clinical examination (i.e., ankle reflexes), and laboratory tests.⁶ Additionally, nerve conduction studies (peroneal and posterior tibial nerves) help determine the type of nerve damage (axonal or demyelinating), distribution (symmetric or asymmetric, distal, or proximal), and severity.

Therapeutic doses of the B-vitamins (B1, B6, and/or B12) are commonly used in patients with PN but there are no evidence-based guidelines as to whether vitamin deficiency should be suspected or treated in such patients.⁷ The present systematic review and metaanalysis investigated the association between low statuses of the B-vitamins and the presence of PN/pain and the effect of vitamin treatment on PN/pain symptoms. We studied the odds of patients with PN/pain having lowered vitamin biomarkers compared to those without PN/pain, and whether neuropathy symptoms are more likely to improve after treatment with vitamins B1, B6, and/or B12 than after a control treatment.

METHODS

The study is registered at the International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO) (ID: CRD42020144917). The protocol was prepared before starting the search.

Search and screening strategies

The search, screening, and data abstraction were independently conducted by JS and RO. The search was conducted in PubMed and Web of Science on 18 September 2018 using the terms shown in Table S1. A manual search of the grey literature and the references of relevant reviews was performed. We screened the titles and abstracts followed by the full texts of potentially relevant articles. The corresponding authors of relevant articles published between January 2010 and September 2018 were asked to provide additional data.

We included human studies of adult men and women. Neuropathy could be idiopathic or associated with viral infections, cancer, renal insufficiency, carpal tunnel syndrome, chemotherapy, alcoholism, diabetes, or Parkinson's disease. The design of observational studies could be cohort, case-control, or cross-sectional. Studies should report plasma/serum concentrations of vitamins B1, B6, and/or B12 (vitamin B12 [or holotranscobalamin], B1, B6); functional markers such as total homocysteine (tHcy) or methylmalonic acid (MMA); or functional enzymatic tests. We applied no restriction to the clinical tests used to diagnose PN and pain.

The design of interventional studies could be randomized- or quasi-randomized-controlled, open-labelled, or single or doubleblind. The comparators could be placebo, no treatment, or non-drug comparators (i.e., Chinese herbs). All dosages, routes of administration, combinations, durations, and forms of the vitamins (i.e., thiamine-HCl, benfothiamine, cyanocobalamin, and methylcobalamin) were eligible. Studies testing vitamins plus a drug versus the drug without the vitamins could be included. The outcome of the intervention studies was improvement of PN/pain syndromes (vs. no improvement/worsened). No restriction was applied to the medical tests used to evaluate PN or pain. In studies applying multiple tests to diagnose PN, alternative tests were used in the sensitivity analyses.

We excluded multiple publications, non-English language articles, reviews, case series, case reports, studies not measuring biomarkers, studies with <20 participants, and when all patients were deficient or all received vitamins. We excluded studies in children, pregnant women, patients with liver disorders, inherited diseases associated with neuropathy, optic neuropathy, autonomic neuropathies, reports on vitamin B6 overdose-induced neuropathy, pain caused by an acute trauma, accidents, or operations, studies on cerebrospinal fluid biomarkers, and trials testing vitamins against drugs. Intervention studies in patients with herpes infection and carpal tunnel syndrome were excluded.

Data extraction

We documented PMID, first author, publication year, design, number (*n*) of participants, *n* male/*n* female, age, recruitment years, country, setting, inclusion and exclusion criteria, suspected main disease associated with PN, medications, comorbidities, PN/pain diagnostic tests, vitamin biomarkers, analytical methods used to measure the markers, study-specific definition of a low vitamin status, and *n* of deficient/sufficient patients with PN/pain and those without PN/ pain. For treatment studies, we documented *n* of responders (improved) and non-responders (not improve/worsened) in each treatment arm. The information was captured in 2*2 contingency and Excel tables.

Data tabulation and statistical analyses

The effect size to be analyzed was the odds ratio (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (95% CIs) that were calculated for each vitamin marker and clinical test result. A Mantel-Haenszel-type estimator in a random effect model was used where each study is weighted by the inverse of its variance. Pooled estimates and 95% Cls were calculated from the individual OR. The results were metaanalyzed when the number of studies was ≥3 and Forest plot was used to plot the data. Cochran Q Test and I^2 were used to study the heterogeneity between the studies. Sources of heterogeneity were investigated in subgroup analyses. Publication bias was investigated by using Egger's regression that tests the hypothesis that the regression intercept is zero. Duval and Tweedie's "trim and fill" method was applied to correct the point estimates for publication bias. Funnel plot of the standard error (SE) by log-OR are presented for the main analyses. Values of p < 0.05 were considered statistically significant. The data analyses were conducted using the Comprehensive Meta-Analysis software programme (version 3.0).

Subgroup, sensitivity, and post hoc analyses

The association between PN and lowered vitamin B12 was studied according to the continent of the study origin (i.e., due to different medical practices and prevalence of deficiencies); the underlying diseases; publication years; and cut-off values used to define low vitamin B12. Studies in patients with diabetes were additionally analyzed according to metformin use. Moreover, we used a global definition of vitamin B12 deficiency that prioritizes the markers as follows: vitamin B12 as the first line marker, followed by MMA, and tHcy. The data analyses were repeated after excluding the studies one-by-one and evaluating the consistency of the estimates. We conducted post hoc analysis of the association between low plasma folate and PN from the studies that we identified in the present search.

For the primary analyses of intervention studies that included multiple clinical tests we used the most objective test (i.e., clinical examination by a physician) to define improvement. The sensitivity analyses included results of less certain tests (i.e., self-reported symptoms). In studies with several follow-up time points, the main analyses included the later time point (i.e., Parkinson's disease after receiving L-dopa), while the results in drug-näive subjects were analyzed in the sensitivity analyses.

We used the study quality and bias assessment tools according to the Newcastle-Ottawa Scale for case-control studies⁸ and the revised form adapted for cross-sectional studies.⁹ The overall quality was interpreted from the total scores.¹⁰ The revised tool for assessing risk of bias in randomized trials (RoB 2) was used.¹¹ All studies were included in the data synthesis regardless of their quality.

RESULTS

Search results

The initial search identified 5174 articles, of which 1329 titles and abstracts were screened and 1078 were excluded (Figure 1). The remaining 251 articles plus one article that was identified from the reference list of a meta-analysis⁷ passed to the full-text screening that led us to exclude a further 198 articles. We contacted 36 authors, of whom 13 provided additional data, while 16 potentially relevant articles were not included due to failed or implausible replies. The data were approximated from the figures or tables in nine studies.¹²⁻²⁰ The final analysis included 46 observational studies on B-vitamin markers in patients with and without PN¹³⁻⁵⁷ (Tables S2–S4) and seven intervention studies with B-vitamins in patients with PN ⁵⁸⁻⁶⁴ (Table 1 and Table S5). A study on non-neuropathic pain was excluded ⁶⁵

Observational studies

The prevalence of *lowered plasma vitamin B12* was reported in 32 independent studies among 2948 individuals with neuropathy and 9423 individuals without neuropathy (Tables S2–S4). One study was excluded from the data analyses because none of the participants had low vitamin B12.⁵³ Two studies had multiple groups of patients.^{24,34} We found that neuropathy was associated with lowered vitamin B12 levels [pooled estimate (95% CIs) = 1.51 (1.23–1.84)] (Figure 2). The studies showed a moderate heterogeneity (Cochran Q Test l^2 = 43.3%, *p* = 0.003) and no publication bias (*p* = 0.065) (Figure S1A).

The association was not significant in a subgroup of Asian studies (1.43 [0.87–2.36], n = 10, $l^2 = 63.5\%$, p = 0.003).^{18,20,25,29,34,36,37,45,51} The European^{14,17,22,26,28,30,32,38,42,46,47,57} and the North American studies^{15,19,24,35,40,41,43,44,52,56} showed significant associations between lowered vitamin B12 and PN (1.66 [1.20–2.31], n = 12, $l^2 = 13.4\%$, p = 0.314) and (1.55 [1.14–2.10], n = 11, $l^2 = 44.8\%$, p = 0.053), respectively (Figure S2).

The presence of neuropathy was associated with lowered vitamin B12 concentrations among patients with diabetes (1.27 [0.87–1.85], n = 11, $l^2 = 49.7\%$, p = 0.030) ^{22–24,26,32,34,37,45,51}; HIV infection (9.20 [1.85–45.82], n = 3, $l^2 = 0\%$, p = 0.908) ^{19,35,40}; Parkinson's disease (2.74 [1.74–4.31], n = 7, $l^2 = 0\%$, p = 0.894) ^{14,17,18,30,42,46,47}; and in idiopathic-^{15,20,25,28,29,36,43,44,52,56,57} and alcohol-related neuropathies^{15,57} combined (1.37 [1.06–1.78], n = 13, $l^2 = 43.6\%$, p = 0.047) (Figure S3). Neuropathy was not significantly associated with lowered vitamin B12 in five studies among patients receiving metformin (1.50 [0.77–2.94], $l^2 = 69.1\%$, p = 0.011) and in six studies among patients not exclusively treated with metformin (1.10 [0.72–1.68], $l^2 = 16.3\%$, p = 0.309) (Figure S4).

The association between PN and lowered B12 was significant in 22 studies published between 2011 and 2018 (1.54 [1.22–1.94],



FIGURE 1 PRISMA study flow diagram. [Colour figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

 l^2 = 48.5%, p = 0.006), but not in studies published before 2000 (n = 5) or those published between 2000 and 2010 (n = 7) (Figure S5).

Neuropathy was associated with lowered vitamin B12 defined using cut-offs \geq 205 ng/L (1.71 [1.20–2.43], n = 14, $l^2 = 56.3\%$, p = 0.005) or below 205 ng/L (1.38 [1.04–1.83], n = 18, $l^2 = 37.3\%$, p = 0.056) (Figure S6, Table S6).

Nine studies reported *concentrations of MMA* in relation to the presence of neuropathy in 827 individuals with neuropathy and 1492 without neuropathy.^{18,21,30,36,38,49,50,52,53} An additional study reported a combination of lowered vitamin B12 or elevated MMA.⁴⁴ The presence of neuropathy was associated with elevated MMA (2.53 [1.39–4.60], $l^2 = 63.8\%$, p = 0.005) (Figure 3). The studies showed a significant publication bias (p = 0.033). The pooled estimate after applying Duval and Tweedie's "trim and fill" method was 1.50 (0.81–2.78) (Figure S1B). Excluding studies one-by-one did not change the results (data not shown).

Neuropathy was associated with elevated plasma tHcy in 15 studies including 1047 patients with neuropathy and 4763 without neuropathy (3.48 [2.01–6.04], l^2 = 70.6%, p < 0.001). ^{12,14,17,22,27,30,33,38,39,42,44,47,48,52,53} No publication bias was observed (p = 0.276) (Figure 4 and Figure S1C) and no significant change of the estimate after one-by-one exclusion of the studies (data not shown).

Elevated tHcy was associated with neuropathy in studies among patients with Parkinson's diseases (n = 6) and idiopathic neuropathy (n = 4), while the association was not statistically significant in patients with diabetes (n = 5) (Figure S7).

The sensitivity analysis showed that the association between neuropathy and lowered vitamin B12 remained significant after replacing one study reporting an alternative definition of lowered B12 status and six studies using alternative diagnosis of neuropathy (1.42 [1.14–1.78], n = 34, $l^2 = 50.8\%$, p < 0.001) (Figure S8). This association showed publication bias (p = 0.006, Eggers regression

				limple in				
Study	Design	Total <i>n/n</i> men	Primary aim	Country	Vitamin vs. comparator	Duration, davs	Definition of PN/or pain	PN assessment
Li et al., 2016 ⁵⁸		232/122	Effect of oral Methyl B12 vs. acetyl-L-carnitine in patients with diabetic PN	China	 1.5 mg Methyl B12 vs. 1500 mg acetyl-L-carnitine 	168	Diabetic PN	Electrodiagnostic criteria from San Antonio Conference, abnormal NCV and/or amplitude in ≥1 nerve of the extremities
Haupt et al., 2005 ⁶¹	Randomized double-blind controlled	40/23	Effect of oral benfothiamine vs. placebo in patients with distal diabetic PN	Germany	400 mg benfothiamine vs. placebo	21	Distal diabetic PN	Physical examination (motor/sensory function, coordination, reflexes), pain history
Abbas et al., 1997 ⁶²	Double-blind controlled	200/106	Effect of oral B1+B6 in high vs. low dose in patients with diabetic PN (28 days)	Tanzania	High dose: 50 mg B1 + 100 mg B6 (d 1–3), 25 mg B1 + 50 mg B6 (d 4–28) vs. low dose: (2 mg B1 + 2 mg B6 [d 1–3], 1 mg B1 + 1 mg B6 [d 4–28])	58	Diabetic PN	>2 or more of the following: clinical symptoms, loss of light touch, impaired pain perception, absent ankle jerks, impaired temperature perception, impaired vibration sense at the medial malleolus or the great toe
Shindo et al., 1994 ⁵⁹	Open-label controlled	38/23	Effect of oral B12 vs. prostaglandin IV vs. no treatment in patients with diabetic PN	Japan	1.5 mg Methyl B12 vs. no treatment	28	Diabetic PN	Presence of subjective symptoms such as pain, numbness, hypesthesia, increased vibration threshold (upper and/or lower extremity)
McCann et al., 1983 ⁶³	Double-blind controlled	30	Effect of pyridoxine vs. placebo in patients with diabetic PN	Australia	25 mg pyridoxine vs. placebo	84	Diabetic PN	ı
Vasudevan, 2014 ⁶⁴	Open randomized controlled trial	30/14	Pregabalin (±Methyl B12 and lipoic acid) in patients with diabetic PN associated with pain	India	Pregabalin 75 mg, 0.75 mg Methyl B12, 100 mg alpha lipoic acid * 2 daily vs. pregabalin 75 mg * 2 daily	8	Diabetic PN	Bilateral decreased or absent reflexes at the ankles, bilateral decreased vibration, pinprick, fine touch or temperature perception in the distal lower extremities for ≥6 months. confirmed by NCV studies; daily average pain score ≥4 on 11-point NRS (0-10)
Woelk 1998 ⁶⁰	Randomized, placebo- controlled, double-blind	84/59	Effectiveness of benfotiamine and benfotiamine plus B6 and B12 in alcoholic neuropathy compared to placebo	Germany	Placebo; oral benfotiamine 320 mg/d for 4 weeks and 120 mg/d for another 4 weeks; benfotiamine 320 mg/d + 720 mg/d B6 + 2 mg/d B12 for 4 weeks, then 120 mg benfothiamine + 270 mg B6 + 0.75 B12 mg/d for 4 weeks	56	Alcohol-related neuropathy	Data on peripheral nerve function were recorded using a graduated tuning fork; vibration perception threshold at the great toe (major criterion): 8 is normal, 0 severely impaired; pain score on McGill's pain questionnaire ≤ 3 (5 = no pain, 0 = devastating pain); and sensory score ≤ 1 (0 = impaired perception, 2 = no impairment)

TABLE 1 Summary of intervention studies with B-vitamins in patients with neuropathy

Abbreviations: d, day; IV, intravenous; NCV, nerve conduction velocity; NRS, numerical rating scale; PN, peripheral neuropathy.

OR limit imit PN present PN absent DR (939cl) weight Gupta 2018 12.19 2.57 57.94 32/35 7/15 1.45 Cahill 2017 2.60 0.41 16.56 2/8 5/44 1.45 Anmed 2016 0.82 0.35 1.90 11/43 23/78 3.70 Aroda 2016 (i) 0.96 0.37 2.52 5/95 35/641 4.89 Biemans 2015 1.30 0.80 2.12 32/96 8/317 322 de Groot-Kamphuis 2013 0.71 0.26 4/14 4/23 4.84 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28/46 132/191 4.84 Toth 2006 1.00 0.48 2.07 1/5/30 400/800 2.53 9/272 4.43 1/22 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19/245 22/550 5.30 5.30 Mold 2005 9.170 0.46 1/1 7/19 4			Lower	Upper	n low B12	2/total			Relative
Gupta 2018 12.19 2.57 57.94 32/35 7/15 Cahill 2017 2.60 0.41 16.56 2/8 5/44 Ahmed 2016 0.82 0.35 1.90 11/43 23/78 Anda 2016 (l) 2.12 1.10 4.10 13/100 43/653 Anda 2016 (l) 0.96 0.37 2.52 5/95 35/641 Biemans 2015 1.30 0.80 2.12 32/96 88/317 de Groot-Kamphuis 2013 0.71 0.26 1.94 5/66 24/232 Leishear 2012 1.04 0.78 1.39 68/387 32/1900 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28/46 132/191 Toth 2008 31.27 1.79 545.25 20/49 0/22 Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16.0 2/57 1/41 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 20/53 93/272 0.75 5.30 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19/245 22/550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.32 <		OR	limit		PN present	PN absent	O	R (95%CI)	
Cahill 2017 2.60 0.41 16.56 2/8 5/44 Ahmed 2016 0.82 0.35 1.90 11/43 23/78 Aroda 2016 (I) 0.96 0.37 2.52 5/95 35/641 Biemans 2015 1.30 0.80 2.12 32/96 88/317 de Groot-Kamphuis 2013 0.71 0.26 1.94 5/66 24/232 Leishear 2012 1.04 0.76 1.39 0.80 2.21 32/96 Rajabally 2011 1.90 0.39 9.26 4/14 4/23 8.44 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28/46 132/191 4.44 Date 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2/57 1/41 4.43 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 2.15 20/53 9/272 5.30 Moid 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19/245 22/550 5.10 Antrosch 2001 2.15 0.37 1.51 1.33 0.37 1.5 1.32 Vaia 1932 2.19 0.32 15	Gupta 2018	12 19	2 57	57 94	32/35	7/15	E 1 1	<u>+</u>	
Ahmed 2016 0 212 0.35 1.90 11/43 23/78 Aroda 2016 (1) 2.12 1.10 4.10 13/100 43/653 Aroda 2016 (1) 0.96 0.37 2.52 5.96 33/641 Biemans 2015 1.30 0.80 2.12 32/96 88/317 de Groot-Kamphuis 2013 0.71 0.26 1.94 5/66 24/232 Leishear 2012 1.04 0.76 1.39 68/387 323/1900 Rajabally 2011 1.90 0.39 9.26 4/14 4/23 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28/46 132/191 The 2008 31.27 1.79 545.25 20/49 0/22 Ambrosch 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2/57 1/41 Baker 2010 0.71 0.63 2.15 20/53 93/272 Mold 2004 2.02 107 3.80 19/245 22/550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4/43 1/22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3/14 1/37 Veillew 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 7/19 Kiebutz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.66 97.69 5/11 1/12 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 144.6 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 0.1 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 0.17 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 0.46 Merola 2015 9.17 0.66 97.69 5/11 1/12 Fichtenbaum 1956 9.82 0.93 14.6 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 0.13 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoi 2017 0.94 0.027 1.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chernol 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravol 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/221 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/						25.00 A 100765126			
Aroda 2016 (i) 2.12 1.10 4.10 13/100 43/653 Aroda 2016 (i) 0.96 0.37 2.52 5/95 35/641 Biemans 2015 1.30 0.80 2.12 32/96 88/317 de Groot-Kamphuis 2013 0.71 0.26 1.94 5/66 24/232 Leishear 2012 1.04 0.78 1.39 68/387 323/1900 Rajabally 2011 1.90 0.39 9.26 4/14 4/23 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28/46 132/191 Toth 2006 1.00 0.48 2.07 15/30 400/800 Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2/57 1/41 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 215 20/53 93/272 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19/245 22/550 Amoca 2015 9.17 0.68 97.69 5/11 1/12 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 1/12 Kiebutz 1991 13.29 0.77								-	5 S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S
Aroda 2016 (i) 0.96 0.37 2.52 5/95 35/641 Biemans 2015 1.30 0.80 2.12 32/96 88/317 de Groot-Kamphuis 2013 0.71 0.26 1.94 5/66 24/232 Leishear 2012 1.04 0.78 1.39 66/387 323/1900 Anjabally 2011 1.90 0.39 9.26 4/14 4/23 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28/46 132/191 Toth 2006 1.00 0.48 2.07 15/30 400/800 Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2/57 1/41 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19/245 22/550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4/43 1/22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104/17 1/1 1/37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139/16 1/1 1/37 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Yao 1992 0.18 139/16 <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>6423.5023.223</td></t<>									6423.5023.223
Biemans 2015 1.30 0.80 2.12 32 / 96 88 / 317 de Groot-Kamphuis 2013 0.71 0.26 1.94 5 / 66 24 / 232 Leishear 2012 1.04 0.71 0.26 1.94 5 / 66 24 / 232 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 191 1.44 4/14 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 191 1.44 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 191 4.44 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 191 4.43 Baker 2010 0.70 0.48 2.07 15 / 30 400 / 800 4.43 Cadoth 2006 1.07 0.63 2.15 20 / 53 31 / 272 5.30 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19 / 245 22 / 550 4.43 1/22 Fichtenbaum 1995 5.00 0.18 13.9.16 1/1 7/13 0.46 0.46 Merola 2016 9.17 0.86 97.69		0.96	0.37		5/95	35 / 641		_	3.08
de Groot-Kamphuis 2013 0.71 0.26 1.94 5/66 24/232 Leishear 2012 1.04 0.78 1.39 66/387 323 /1900 Rajabally 2011 1.90 0.39 9.26 4/14 4/23 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28/46 132/191 Toth 2008 31.27 1.79 545.25 20/49 0/22 Tambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2/57 1/41 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 2.15 20/53 93/272 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3/14 1/37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 7/19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (II) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4/73 15/162 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Merola 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispi 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Leishod 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 119/39 73/291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 L51 (L23.1.84) 868/2948 2341/9423 Other 0.1 0.1 1 0 100								-	
Leishear 2012 Leishear 2012 1 04 0.78 1.39 68 / 387 323 / 1900 Rajabally 2011 1.90 0.39 9.26 4 / 14 4 / 23 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 191 Toth 2008 3127 1.79 545.25 20 / 49 0 / 22 Hin 2006 1.00 0.48 2.07 15 / 30 400 / 800 Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16 60 2 / 57 1 / 41 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 2.15 20 / 53 93 / 272 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19 / 245 22 / 550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20 5.3 4 / 43 1 / 22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3 / 14 1 / 37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1 / 1 7 / 19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3.7 5 13 / 32 Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10 / 34 0 / 15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5 / 11 1 / 12 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4 / 21 8 / 43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19 / 68 39 / 115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3 / 50 1 1 / 10 Kieburtz 1991 13.20 1.73 2.43.27 10 / 34 0 / 15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5 / 11 1 / 12 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4 / 21 8 / 43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19 / 68 39 / 115 Chen 2011 0.31 1.44 1.20 1 1/2 273 / 600 887 / 2415 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194 / 519 13 / 74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1 / 15 0 / 11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273 / 600 887 / 2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14 / 27 31 / 123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19 / 97 73 / 213 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133	de Groot-Kamphuis 2013					24 / 232		_	2.90
Rajabally 2011 1.90 0.39 9.26 4 / 14 4 / 23 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 19 14 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 19 14 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 19 14 Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 19 14 Baker 2010 0.70 0.48 2.07 15 / 30 400 / 800 Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16 60 2 / 57 1 / 14 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 2.15 20 / 53 93 / 272 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3 / 14 1 / 37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 13.16 1 / 1 1 / 12 Ehhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4 / 21 8 / 43 Rizzada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19 / 68 39 / 115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.41 3 / 50 <								F	
Baker 2010 0.70 0.36 1.35 28 / 46 132 / 191 Toth 2008 31.27 1.79 545.25 20 / 49 0 / 22 Hin 2006 1.00 0.48 2.07 15 / 30 400 / 800 Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2/57 1 / 41 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 2.15 20 / 53 93 / 272 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19 / 245 22 / 550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4/43 1 / 22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3 / 14 1 / 37 Veileux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1 / 1 7 / 19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3 / 5 1.00 Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10 / 34 0 / 15 Merola 2018 (II) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4 / 73 15 / 162 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.94 4 / 26 5 / 58 Yang 2017 0.94									
Toth 2008 31.27 1.79 545.25 20 / 49 0 / 22 Hin 2006 1.00 0.48 2.07 15 / 30 400 / 800 Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2 / 57 1 / 41 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 2.15 20 / 53 93 / 272 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19 / 245 22 / 550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4 / 43 1 / 37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1 / 1 7 / 19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3 / 5 13 / 31 0 / 15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5 / 11 1 / 12 1.00 Ehhadd 2018 (l) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4 / 73 15 / 162 1.88 2.41 Ehhad 2018 (l) 0.03 0.27 3.90 4 / 21 8 / 43 4.92 0.72 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1 / 9 2 / 17 0.59 5.17 Yang 2018 2.								-	
Hin 2006 1.00 0.48 2.07 15 / 30 400 / 800 Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2 / 57 1 / 41 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 2.15 20 / 53 93 / 272 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19 / 245 22 / 550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4 / 43 1 / 22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3 / 14 1 / 37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1 / 1 7 / 19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3 / 5 13 / 32 Kiebutz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10 / 34 0 / 15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5 / 11 1 / 12 Elhadd 2018 (ll) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4 / 21 8 / 43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19 / 68 39 / 115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 1.41 3 / 50 1 / 50 Yang 2016 1.93 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>(1) (1) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2</td>									(1) (1) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2
Zambelis 2005 1.45 0.13 16.60 2/57 1/41 Gadoth 2006 1.17 0.63 2.15 20/53 93/272 Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19/245 22/550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4/43 1/22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3/14 1/37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 7/19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Kiebutz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/.34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (ll) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 <							_		
Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19/245 22/550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4/43 1/22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3/14 1/37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 7/19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (l) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4/73 15/162 Elhadd 2018 (l) 0.076 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoil 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05	Zambelis 2005	1.45	0.13	16.60	2/57	1/41			0.65
Mold 2004 2.02 1.07 3.80 19/245 22/550 Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4/43 1/22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3/14 1/37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 7/19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23	Gadoth 2006	1.17	0.63	2.15	20 / 53	93 / 272	-	H	5.30
Ambrosch 2001 2.15 0.23 20.53 4/43 1/22 Fichtenbaum 1995 9.82 0.93 104.17 3/14 1/37 Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 7/19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Kieburt 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (I) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4/73 15/162 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 3.13 1.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23	Mold 2004		1.07		19 / 245	22 / 550			2020 (CE 451)
Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 7/19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (l) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4/73 15/162 Elhadd 2018 (l) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72	Ambrosch 2001		0.23						525262633
Veilleux 1995 5.00 0.18 139.16 1/1 7/19 Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (l) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4/73 15/162 Elhadd 2018 (l) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72	Fichtenbaum 1995	9.82	0.93	104.17	3/14	1/37			0.68
Yao 1992 2.19 0.32 15.00 3/5 13/32 Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (I) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4/73 15/162 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 9.42 Mancini 2014 2.20 1.36							· · · · ·		
Kieburtz 1991 13.29 0.73 243.27 10/34 0/15 Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (I) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4/73 15/162 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>5070905 P075900</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>						5070905 P075900			
Merola 2015 9.17 0.86 97.69 5/11 1/12 Elhadd 2018 (I) 0.57 0.18 1.78 4/73 15/162 Elhadd 2018 (II) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.99 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>-</td> <td></td> <td></td>							-		
Elhadd 2018 (ii) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868/2948 2341/9423 0.01 0.1 1 10 100						10010 1000	+		
Elhadd 2018 (ii) 1.03 0.27 3.90 4/21 8/43 Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868/2948 2341/9423 0.01 0.1 1 10 100	Elhadd 2018 (I)	0.57	0.18	1.78	4/73	15 / 162	_	-	2.41
Raizada 2017 0.76 0.39 1.46 19/68 39/115 Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887 / 2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868 / 2948 2341 / 9423 0.01 0.1 1 10						1.0.5757 2.57572	→		
Chen 2011 3.13 0.31 31.14 3/50 1/50 Rispoli 2017 0.94 0.07 12.00 1/9 2/17 Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887 / 2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868 / 2948 2341 / 9423 0.01 0.1 1 100						122/03 03200		-	
Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868/2948 2341/9423 0.01 0.1 1 100						40703300 9003500 U			
Fennelly 1964 0.94 0.26 3.44 10/26 6/15 Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4/26 5/58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194/519 13/74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1/15 0/11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273/600 887/2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14/27 31/123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19/39 73/291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868/2948 2341/9423 0.01 0.1 1 100	Rispoli 2017	0.94	0.07	12.00	1/9	2/17			0.59
Crespo-Burillo 2016 1.93 0.47 7.86 4 / 26 5 / 58 Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194 / 519 13 / 74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1 / 15 0 / 11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273 / 600 887 / 2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14 / 27 31 / 123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19 / 39 73 / 291 3.60 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 4.54 0.01 0.1 1 10 100									
Yang 2018 2.80 1.50 5.23 194 / 519 13 / 74 Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1 / 15 0 / 11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273 / 600 887 / 2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14 / 27 31 / 123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19 / 39 73 / 291 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868 / 2948 2341 / 9423 0.01 0.1 1 100						5/58			
Park 2017 2.38 0.09 64.05 1 / 15 0 / 11 Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273 / 600 887 / 2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14 / 27 31 / 123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19 / 39 73 / 291 4.73 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 4.54 0.01 0.1 1 10 100		2.80	1.50	5.23	194 / 519	13 / 74			5.17
Oberlin 2013 1.44 1.20 1.72 273 / 600 887 / 2415 Mancini 2014 3.20 1.36 7.53 14 / 27 31 / 123 Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19 / 39 73 / 291 4.73 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 4.54 0.01 0.1 1 10 100		2.38	0.09		1/15	0/11	2 	-	0.36
Ceravolo 2013 2.84 1.44 5.61 19 / 39 73 / 291 4.73 Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20 / 43 38 / 133 4.54 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868 / 2948 2341 / 9423 0.01 0.1 1 10	Oberlin 2013	1.44	1.20		273 / 600	887 / 2415			9.42
Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868/2948 2341/9423 0.01 0.1 1 10 100 Conform 0 Tart 12 = 43.2% n = 0.003	Mancini 2014	3.20	1.36	7.53	14 / 27	31 / 123		(3.60
Sun 2014 2.17 1.07 4.41 20/43 38/133 1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868/2948 2341/9423 0.01 0.1 1 10 100 Conform 0 Tart 12 = 43.2% n = 0.003	Ceravolo 2013					73 / 291			
1.51 (1.23-1.84) 868 / 2948 2341 / 9423 ♦ 0.01 0.1 1 10 100								-	2000.00.00
0.01 0.1 1 10 100		1.51 (1	23.1.84)			2341 / 9423		•	0.000
Cookern O Tost $1^2 = 42.29$, $n = 0.002$					00072040		01 01 1	10	100
Cochran Q Test $I^2 = 43.3\%$, p = 0.003						0.0		10	
Normal B12 Lowered B12	Cochran Q Test I ² = 43.3%	p = 0.00	13				Normal B12	Lowered B	12

FIGURE 2 Forest plot of the association between the presence of peripheral neuropathy (PN) and low plasma concentrations of vitamin B12 in observational studies.

test). The estimate was 1.06 (0.94–1.19) after correcting for publication bias. Also, the association between PN and elevated plasma tHcy (2.93 [1.77–4.84], n = 15, $l^2 = 77.9\%$, p < 0.001) or elevated MMA (2.20 [1.29–3.72], n = 9, $l^2 = 67.8\%$, p = 0.002) remained significant when alternative definition of PN was used in the study of Hin et al.³⁸

Neuropathy was associated with low vitamin B12 status defined using a global approach (i.e., B12 > MMA > tHcy) [(1.56 [1.31–1.86], n = 43, $l^2 = 40.6\%$, p = 0.004) (Figure S9). A significant publication bias was detected (p = 0.023), but the adjusted estimate remained significant (1.37 [1.24–1.52]). Neuropathy was not significantly associated with lowered vitamin B1 or vitamin B6 (Figure S10).

Most observational studies were of good or fair quality (Table S7).

Intervention studies

Seven studies used at least one vitamin (B1, B6, or B12) to treat neurop- athy $^{\rm 58-64}$ (Table 1). The OR of improvement in patients treated with B12

(vs. controls) was 1.36 (0.66–2.79), n = 4, $l^2 = 28.9\%$ (Figure S11A).^{58–60,64} Similar results were seen when alternative tests were used to define improvement (1.23 [0.64–2.39], $l^2 = 28.6\%$, p = 0.241).

The association between symptom improvement after B12 alone or a combination of B12, B1, and B6 (n = 7) was not significant (2.58 [0.98–6.79], $l^2 = 80.0\%$, p < 0.001) (Figure S11B). Alternative definitions of improvement yielded similar estimates (2.52 [0.98–6.50], $l^2 = 80.8\%$, p < 0.001). The estimates were significant when the study of Li et al. ⁵⁸ or that of McCann et al. ⁶³ was excluded.

Treatment with vitamin B1 was associated with symptom improvement (5.34 [1.87–15.19], n = 3, $l^2 = 64.6\%$, p = 0.059).^{60–62} The sensitivity analysis showed similar results (4.60 [1.24–17.12]). Vitamin B6 was not associated with improvement (2.61 (0.42–16.36), n = 3, $l^2 = 86.3\%$, p = 0.001).

There were similar or no side effects in three vitamin trials, while four trials did not report safety results⁶¹⁻⁶⁴ (Table S8).

Most intervention studies exhibited some concerns in the design (Table S9). Violations were often due to underreporting, rather than to a clear bias in the study designs.



FIGURE 3 Forest plot of the association between the presence of peripheral neuropathy (PN) and elevated plasma methylmalonic acid (MMA) in observational studies.

	Lower		Upper	n elevated tHcy/total			OR (95%CI)				Relative		
	OR	limit	limit	PN present	PN absent		,	JR (957	/0C1)		weight		
Toth 2010	28.67	1.98	414.19	2/5	1/44	1	1	1 -	\rightarrow	\rightarrow	3.10		
Toth 2008	301.15	16.22	5590.05	43 / 49	0 / 22				-	\rightarrow	2.71		
Hin 2006	2.40	1.09	5.31	21/30	394 / 800				<u>-</u>		9.26		
Ambrosch 2001	9.10	1.10	74.98	13 / 43	1/22				-		4.27		
Buysschaert 2000	1.67	0.73	3.81	27 / 77	11 / 45			+∎-	-		9.12		
Merola 2015	22.50	2.60	194.51	9 / 11	2/12					->	4.15		
Andréasson 2017	4.90	0.84	28.73	14 / 16	10/17			-	-	2	5.25		
de Luis 2005	1.38	0.28	6.85	2 / 11	20 / 144				_		5.81		
Hoogeveen 1999	0.54	0.18	1.60	4 / 25	148 / 569		-				7.93		
Rispoli 2017	1.73	0.06	46.77	9/9	16/17			-		-	2.24		
Crespo-Burillo 2016	2.13	0.73	6.26	8/26	10/58				<u> </u>		7.97		
Russo 2016	1.62	0.89	2.94	24 / 79	39/184				3		10.11		
Oberlin 2013	9.80	4.95	19.39	28 / 600	12/2415				-		9.75		
Mancini 2014	2.81	1.11	7.13	20 / 27	62 / 123			-	—		8.64		
Ceravolo 2013	4.78	2.38	9.60	24 / 39	73 / 291						9.69		
	3.48	(2.01-6.0	4)	248/1047	799/4763	0.01	0.1	1	♦ 10	100			





FIGURE 4 Forest plot of the association between the presence of peripheral neuropathy (PN) and elevated plasma total homocysteine (tHcy) in observational studies.

DISCUSSION

We have shown that patients with PN had higher probabilities of lowered vitamin B12 (OR = 1.51 [1.23-1.84]) and elevated MMA

(2.53 [1.39-4.60]) and tHcy concentrations (3.48 [2.01-6.04]) compared to patients without PN. The associations between lowered vitamin B12 and PN were rather consistent in subgroups of countries, comorbidities, publication years, and according to cut-off values of vitamin B12 concentrations. Studies conducted in patients with type 2 diabetes explained some of the observed heterogeneity. Furthermore, we found a non-significant higher OR of patients with PN to show improvement after vitamin B12 treatment compared to the comparators. Treatment with vitamin B1 was associated with improvement of PN symptoms compared to the control treatments.

Interpretation and translation into practice

Hyperhomocysteinaemia and vitamin B12 deficiency are often detected in patients affected with diseases associated with neuropathy such as diabetes,⁶⁶ alcoholism,⁶⁷ Parkinson's disease (treated with L-dopa),⁶⁸ or HIV infection.⁶⁹ Vitamin B12 deficiency could be a modifiable risk factor for neuropathy in those patients. A previous systematic review on the effect of B-vitamins among patients with alcohol- and diabetes-neuropathy was inconclusive.⁷ Our results strongly suggest that screening for and treating vitamin B12 deficiency should be recommended for patients at risk for neuropathy and those with neuropathy. We have shown that the OR of elevated tHcy or MMA in patients with PN was higher than that of lowered vitamin B12. This observation supports using tHcy as a screening marker, since MMA measurement is expensive and requires highly equipped laboratories. Although the vitamin B12 test is widely used, lowered vitamin B12 concentrations show low sensitivity in detecting deficiency. Moreover, higher MMA and tHcy in elderly people and those with renal insufficiency, especially in patients with diabetes, may have increased the heterogeneity of the analysis and reduced the chance of detecting significant associations in subgroup analysis.

There is a need for consensus regarding the selection of markers to be used in detecting vitamin B12 deficiency in patients with PN. The German Society of Neurology recommended screening for vitamin B12 deficiency in patients with PN using vitamin B12 (or holotranscobalamin) and MMA.⁷⁰ Yetley et al. suggested using circulating vitamin B12 or holotranscobalamin and one functional marker, such as MMA or tHcy, to diagnose vitamin B12 deficiency.⁷¹ The cutoff values for vitamin B12 are debatable and some authors proposed using cut-off values up to 258 or 300 nmol/L (or 191–222 pg/L) to capture all patients with probable deficiency.⁷² Detection of low vitamin B12 in patients with PN could identify a subgroup of patients who may benefit from treatment.

A causal role for low B12 or elevated tHcy or MMA in neuropathy is uncertain, although the consistency in the evidence from observational and treatment studies in the present meta-analysis is suggestive of causality. Individuals who showed elevated tHcy after 6 years follow-up had lower nerve conduction velocity and abnormalities in monofilament compared to patients whose tHcy remained normal.⁴¹ Longitudinal studies are needed to show if low B-vitamins in subjects who are free of neuropathy may predict future risk of the disease.

The associations between neuropathy and lowered vitamin B1 and B6 were inconclusive possibly due to the low number of studies, although some studies that showed significant associations^{73,74} could not be analyzed in the present study.

Limitations

The present study has some limitations. The search was limited to English language articles published in PubMed and Web of Science, which may have caused publication bias or overestimation of the associations. However, our study depending on biomarkers and including PN associated with several diseases enabled us to synthesize evidence from a large number of studies, compared to previous systematic reviews.^{7,75} Overall the results were consistent in the direction and the strength of the associations. The sensitivity and subgroup analyses have shown small variations in the pooled estimates, while the loss of significance in the subgroup analyses could be due to the low number of studies. Finally, the association of low vitamin B12 status and the presence of neuropathy was confirmed by using three independent markers of vitamin B12 status, suggesting that the results were not due to chance.

Gaps in the literature and recommendations for future research

There are mechanistically plausible data on a possible role of folic acid as a neuroprotective vitamin. We did not intend to capture studies on folate concentrations because the widely applied fortification with folic acid can bias the associations. We encountered and analyzed data from 12 studies reporting on plasma folate and neuropathy (results are not based on systematic search). Most of the studies did not find lower concentrations of folate or higher prevalence of deficiency in patients with PN compared to those without PN (Table S10). Plasma concentrations of tHcy could be elevated due to vitamin B12 and/or folate deficiency. Identifying elevated tHcy levels implies exploring the cause and lowering tHcy by using the appropriate vitamins or their combinations, since tHcy itself could be neurotoxic.

Notably, the vitamin trials have shortcomings that limit extrapolation of the results to all patients with PN. The limitations include small sample size, short treatment duration (3–24 weeks), and inclusion of mainly diabetes neuropathy (with rather high heterogeneity). Moreover, it is not clear whether the treatment with the vitamins should be better tailored to patients with low vitamin concentrations who are more likely to benefit. Future interventions should investigate vitamin statuses prior to administrating the vitamins.

CONCLUSIONS

We found that neuropathy was associated with lowered vitamin B12 status as indicated by plasma vitamin B12, MMA, and tHcy. This association was observed regardless of the primary disease that was believed to be the cause of neuropathy. The associations between neuropathy and vitamin B1 and B6 deficiencies were inconclusive. Treatment of neuropathy is a challenge. The association between vitamin B1 and B12 status and neuropathy symptoms or improvement after treatment suggests that treating nutritional deficiencies (including lowering plasma tHcy) should be part of the healthcare management of neuropathy and all morbidities associated with high risk of neuropathy.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We acknowledge sharing the data upon our request to the corresponding authors of previous studies. Open Access funding enabled and organized by Projekt DEAL. WOA Institution: Universitatsklinikum des Saarlandes und Medizinische Fakultat der Universitat des Saarlandes Blended DEAL: Projekt DEAL

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

JS and JG: nothing to disclose. RO: received speaker honoraria from Merck Selfmedikation.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

JS (MD Candidate, Homburg, Germany): developed the protocol, search, author contact, data extraction, data analysis, and revision of the publication. JG (MD, PhD, Homburg, Germany): provided input to the design and the intellectual content of the final draft of the manuscript. RO (PhD, Homburg, Germany): planned, designed, and conceptualized the study, prepared the first draft of the protocol, participated in the search, review, data extraction, supervised data analyses, and wrote the manuscript.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

All data related to this article can be made available to investigators on request to the corresponding author.

ORCID

Rima Obeid 🔟 https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0064-7029

REFERENCES

- Hanewinckel R, Drenthen J, van Oijen M, et al. Prevalence of polyneuropathy in the general middle-aged and elderly population. *Neurology*. 2016;87:1892-1898.
- Staff NP, Windebank AJ. Peripheral neuropathy due to vitamin deficiency, toxins, and medications. *Continuum (Minneap Minn)*. 2014;20:1293-1306.
- 3. Sommer C, Geber C, Young P, et al. Polyneuropathies. *Dtsch Arztebl Int*. 2018;115:83-90.
- Obeid R, Herrmann W. Mechanisms of homocysteine neurotoxicity in neurodegenerative diseases with special reference to dementia. *FEBS Lett.* 2006;580:2994-3005.
- Kalita J, Chandra S, Bhoi SK, et al. Clinical, nerve conduction and nerve biopsy study in vitamin B12 deficiency neurological syndrome with a short-term follow-up. *Nutr Neurosci*. 2014;17:156-163.
- Lehmann HC, Wunderlich G, Fink GR, Sommer C. Diagnosis of peripheral neuropathy. *Neurol Res Pract*. 2020;2:20.
- 7. Ang CD, Alviar MJ, Dans AL, et al. Vitamin B for treating peripheral neuropathy. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev.* 2008;3:CD004573.

- Wells GA, Shea B, O'Connell D, et al. The Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) for assessing the quality of nonrandomised studies in meta-analyses. Ottawa Hospital Research Institute. http://www. ohri.ca/programs/clinical_epidemiology/oxford.asp. Accessed 2019.
- Modesti PA, Reboldi G, Cappuccio FP, et al. Panethnic differences in blood pressure in Europe: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *PLoS ONE*. 2016;11:e0147601.
- Sharmin S, Kypri K, Khanam M, et al. Parental supply of alcohol in childhood and risky drinking in adolescence: systematic review and meta-analysis. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2017;14:287.
- 11. Sterne JAC, Savovic J, Page MJ, et al. RoB 2: a revised tool for assessing risk of bias in randomised trials. *BMJ*. 2019;366:I4898.
- Andreasson M, Brodin L, Laffita-Mesa JM, Svenningsson P. Correlations between methionine cycle metabolism, COMT genotype, and polyneuropathy in L-dopa treated Parkinson's disease: a preliminary cross-sectional study. J Parkinsons Dis. 2017;7:619-628.
- Byers CM, DeLisa JA, Frankel DL, Kraft GH. Pyridoxine metabolism in carpal tunnel syndrome with and without peripheral neuropathy. *Arch Phys Med Rehabil.* 1984;65:712-716.
- Ceravolo R, Cossu G, di Bandettini PM, et al. Neuropathy and levodopa in Parkinson's disease: evidence from a multicenter study. *Mov Disord*. 2013;28:1391-1397.
- 15. Fennelly YJ, Frank O, Baker H, Leevy CM. Peripheral neuropathy of the alcoholic: I, aetiological role of aneurin and other B-complex vitamins. *Br Med J*. 1964;2:1290-1292.
- Grim J, Ticha A, Hyspler R, Valis M, Zadak Z. Selected risk nutritional factors for chemotherapy-induced polyneuropathy. *Nutrients*. 2017;9:535.
- Mancini F, Comi C, Oggioni GD, et al. Prevalence and features of peripheral neuropathy in Parkinson's disease patients under different therapeutic regimens. *Parkinsonism Relat Disord*. 2014;20:27-31.
- Park JS, Park D, Ko PW, Kang K, Lee HW. Serum methylmalonic acid correlates with neuropathic pain in idiopathic Parkinson's disease. *Neurol Sci.* 2017;38:1799-1804.
- Veilleux M, Paltiel O, Falutz J. Sensorimotor neuropathy and abnormal vitamin B12 metabolism in early HIV infection. *Can J Neurol Sci.* 1995;22:43-46.
- 20. Yang GT, Zhao HY, Kong Y, Sun NN, Dong AQ. Correlation between serum vitamin B12 level and peripheral neuropathy in atrophic gastritis. *World J Gastroenterol.* 2018;24:1343-1352.
- 21. Adewumi A, Titilope A, Akinsegun A, Vincent O, Alani A. Urine methylmalonic acid levels in HIV-infected adults with peripheral neuropathy. *Caspian J Intern Med.* 2013;4:707-711.
- 22. Ambrosch A, Dierkes J, Lobmann R, et al. Relation between homocysteinaemia and diabetic neuropathy in patients with Type 2 diabetes mellitus. *Diabet Med.* 2001;18:185-192.
- 23. Ahmed MA, Muntingh G, Rheeder P. Vitamin B12 deficiency in metformin-treated type-2 diabetes patients, prevalence and association with peripheral neuropathy. *BMC Pharmacol Toxicol.* 2016;17:44.
- 24. Aroda VR, Edelstein SL, Goldberg RB, et al. Long-term metformin use and vitamin B12 deficiency in the diabetes prevention program outcomes study. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab.* 2016;101:1754-1761.
- 25. Bakar C, Karaman HI, Baba A, Sengunalp F. Effect of high aluminum concentration in water resources on human health, case study: Biga Peninsula, northwest part of Turkey. *Arch Environ Contam Toxicol.* 2010;58:935-944.
- Biemans E, Hart HE, Rutten GE, et al. Cobalamin status and its relation with depression, cognition and neuropathy in patients with type 2 diabetes mellitus using metformin. *Acta Diabetol.* 2015;52:383-393.
- 27. Buysschaert M, Dramais AS, Wallemacq PE, Hermans MP. Hyperhomocysteinemia in type 2 diabetes: relationship to

macroangiopathy, nephropathy, and insulin resistance. *Diabetes Care*. 2000;23:1816-1822.

- Cahill V, McCorry D, Soryal I, Rajabally YA. Newer anti-epileptic drugs, vitamin status and neuropathy: a cross-sectional analysis. *Rev Neurol (Paris).* 2017;173:62-66.
- Chen JY, Chu CC, Lin YS, et al. Nutrient deficiencies as a risk factor in Taiwanese patients with postherpetic neuralgia. Br J Nutr. 2011;106:700-707.
- Crespo-Burillo JA, Almarcegui-Lafta C, Dolz-Zaera I, et al. Prevalence and factors associated with polyneuropathy in Parkinson's disease. *Basal Ganglia*. 2016;6:89-94.
- D'Amour ML, Brissette S, Lavoie J, Butterworth RF. Reduced sensory and motor nerve conduction velocities in moderate drinkers. *Addict Biol.* 2000;5:71-75.
- de Groot-Kamphuis DM, van Dijk PR, Groenier KH, et al. Vitamin B12 deficiency and the lack of its consequences in type 2 diabetes patients using metformin. *Neth J Med.* 2013;71:386-390.
- de Luis DA, Fernandez N, Arranz ML, et al. Total homocysteine levels relation with chronic complications of diabetes, body composition, and other cardiovascular risk factors in a population of patients with diabetes mellitus type 2. J Diabetes Complications. 2005;19:42-46.
- Elhadd T, Ponirakis G, Dabbous Z, et al. Metformin use is not associated with B12 deficiency or neuropathy in patients with type 2 diabetes mellitus in Qatar. Front Endocrinol (Lausanne). 2018;9:248.
- Fichtenbaum CJ, Clifford DB, Powderly WG. Risk factors for dideoxynucleoside-induced toxic neuropathy in patients with the human immunodeficiency virus infection. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr Hum Retrovirol. 1995;10:169-174.
- Gadoth N, Figlin E, Chetrit A, Sela BA, Seligsohn U. The neurology of cobalamin deficiency in an elderly population in Israel. J Neurol. 2006;253:45-50.
- Gupta K, Jain A, Rohatgi A. An observational study of vitamin b12 levels and peripheral neuropathy profile in patients of diabetes mellitus on metformin therapy. *Diabetes Metab Syndr.* 2018;12:51-58.
- Hin H, Clarke R, Sherliker P, et al. Clinical relevance of low serum vitamin B12 concentrations in older people: the Banbury B12 study. *Age Ageing.* 2006;35:416-422.
- Hoogeveen EK, Kostense PJ, Valk GD, et al. Hyperhomocysteinaemia is not related to risk of distal somatic polyneuropathy: the Hoorn Study. J Intern Med. 1999;246:561-566.
- Kieburtz KD, Giang DW, Schiffer RB, Vakil N. Abnormal vitamin B12 metabolism in human immunodeficiency virus infection. Association with neurological dysfunction. *Arch Neurol.* 1991;48:312-314.
- 41. Leishear K, Boudreau RM, Studenski SA, et al. Relationship between vitamin B12 and sensory and motor peripheral nerve function in older adults. *J Am Geriatr Soc.* 2012;60:1057-1063.
- 42. Merola A, Romagnolo A, Zibetti M, et al. Peripheral neuropathy associated with levodopa-carbidopa intestinal infusion: a long-term prospective assessment. *Eur J Neurol*. 2016;23:501-509.
- 43. Mold JW, Vesely SK, Keyl BA, Schenk JB, Roberts M. The prevalence, predictors, and consequences of peripheral sensory neuropathy in older patients. *J Am Board Fam Pract*. 2004;17:309-318.
- Oberlin BS, Tangney CC, Gustashaw KA, Rasmussen HE. Vitamin B12 deficiency in relation to functional disabilities. *Nutrients*. 2013;5:4462-4475.
- Raizada N, Jyotsna VP, Sreenivas V, Tandon N. Serum vitamin B12 levels in type 2 diabetes patients on metformin compared to those never on metformin: a cross-sectional study. *Indian J Endocrinol Metab.* 2017;21:424-428.
- 46. Rajabally YA, Martey J. Neuropathy in Parkinson disease: prevalence and determinants. *Neurology*. 2011;77:1947-1950.

- Rispoli V, Simioni V, Capone JG, et al. Peripheral neuropathy in 30 duodopa patients with vitamins B supplementation. *Acta Neurol Scand.* 2017;136:660-667.
- Russo GT, Giandalia A, Romeo EL, et al. Diabetic neuropathy is not associated with homocysteine, folate, vitamin B12 levels, and MTHFR C677T mutation in type 2 diabetic outpatients taking metformin. J Endocrinol Invest. 2016;39:305-314.
- 49. Schrempf W, Eulitz M, Neumeister V, et al. Utility of measuring vitamin B12 and its active fraction, holotranscobalamin, in neurological vitamin B12 deficiency syndromes. *J Neurol*. 2011;258:393-401.
- 50. Solomon LR. Diabetes as a cause of clinically significant functional cobalamin deficiency. *Diabetes Care*. 2011;34:1077-1080.
- 51. Sun AL, Ni YH, Li XB, et al. Urinary methylmalonic acid as an indicator of early vitamin B12 deficiency and its role in polyneuropathy in type 2 diabetes. *J Diabetes Res.* 2014;2014:921616.
- 52. Toth C, Brown MS, Furtado S, Suchowersky O, Zochodne D. Neuropathy as a potential complication of levodopa use in Parkinson's disease. *Mov Disord*. 2008;23:1850-1859.
- Toth C, Breithaupt K, Ge S, et al. Levodopa, methylmalonic acid, and neuropathy in idiopathic Parkinson disease. Ann Neurol. 2010;68:28-36.
- 54. Tseng CH, Liao CC, Kuo CM, Sung FC, Hsieh DPH, Tsai CH. Medical and non-medical correlates of carpal tunnel syndrome in a Taiwan cohort of one million. *Eur J Neurol*. 2012;19:91-97.
- 55. van der Watt JJ, Benatar MG, Harrison TB, Carrara H, Heckmann JM. Isoniazid exposure and pyridoxine levels in human immunodeficiency virus associated distal sensory neuropathy. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 2015;19:1312-1319.
- Yao Y, Yao SL, Yao SS, Yao G, Lou W. Prevalence of vitamin B12 deficiency among geriatric outpatients. J Fam Pract. 1992;35:524-528.
- Zambelis T, Karandreas N, Tzavellas E, Kokotis P, Liappas J. Large and small fiber neuropathy in chronic alcohol-dependent subjects. *J Peripher Nerv Syst.* 2005;10:375-381.
- Li S, Chen X, Li Q, et al. Effects of acetyl-L-carnitine and methylcobalamin for diabetic peripheral neuropathy: a multicenter, randomized, double-blind, controlled trial. J Diabetes Investig. 2016;7:777-785.
- Shindo H, Tawata M, Inoue M, et al. The effect of prostaglandin E1.alpha CD on vibratory threshold determined with the SMV-5 vibrometer in patients with diabetic neuropathy. *Diabetes Res Clin Pract.* 1994;24:173-180.
- Woelk H, Lehrl S, Bitsch R, Kopcke W. Benfotiamine in treatment of alcoholic polyneuropathy: an 8-week randomized controlled study (BAP I Study). Alcohol Alcohol. 1998;33:631-638.
- Haupt E, Ledermann H, Kopcke W. Benfotiamine in the treatment of diabetic polyneuropathy-a three-week randomized, controlled pilot study (BEDIP study). Int J Clin Pharmacol Ther. 2005;43:71-77.
- Abbas ZG, Swai AB. Evaluation of the efficacy of thiamine and pyridoxine in the treatment of symptomatic diabetic peripheral neuropathy. *East Afr Med J.* 1997;74:803-808.
- McCann VJ, Davis RE. Pyridoxine and diabetic neuropathy: a double-blind controlled study. *Diabetes Care*. 1983;6:102-103.
- 64. Vasudevan D, Naik MM, Mukaddam QI. Efficacy and safety of methylcobalamin, alpha lipoic acid and pregabalin combination versus pregabalin monotherapy in improving pain and nerve conduction velocity in type 2 diabetes associated impaired peripheral neuropathic condition. [MAINTAIN]: results of a pilot study. Ann Indian Acad Neurol. 2014;17:19-24.
- 65. Okumus M, Ceceli E, Tuncay F, et al. The relationship between serum trace elements, vitamin B12, folic acid and clinical parameters in patients with myofascial pain syndrome. *J Back Musculoskelet Rehabil.* 2010;23:187-191.
- Alvarez M, Sierra OR, Saavedra G, Moreno S. Vitamin B12 deficiency and diabetic neuropathy in patients taking metformin: a cross-sectional study. *Endocr Connect*. 2019;8:1324-1329.

- 67. Fernandez-Rodriguez C, Gonzalez-Reimers E, Quintero-Platt G, et al. Homocysteine, liver function derangement and brain atrophy in alcoholics. *Alcohol Alcohol.* 2016;51:691-697.
- Shen Y, Dong ZF, Pan PL, et al. Association of homocysteine, folate, and white matter hyperintensities in Parkinson's patients with different motor phenotypes. *Neurol Sci.* 2019;40: 1855-1863.
- Falasca K, Di NM, Di MG, et al. The impact of homocysteine, B12, and D vitamins levels on functional neurocognitive performance in HIV-positive subjects. *BMC Infect Dis.* 2019;19:105.
- 70. Heuß D. Diagnostik bei Polyneuropathien. Internist. 2020;61: 235-242.
- Yetley EA, Pfeiffer CM, Phinney KW, et al. Biomarkers of vitamin B-12 status in NHANES: a roundtable summary. *Am J Clin Nutr.* 2011;94:313S-321S.
- 72. Smith AD, Refsum H. Do we need to reconsider the desirable blood level of vitamin B12? *J Intern Med.* 2012;271:179-182.
- 73. Winkler G, Pal B, Nagybeganyi E, et al. Effectiveness of different benfotiamine dosage regimens in the treatment of painful diabetic neuropathy. *Arzneimittelforschung.* 1999;49:220-224.

- 74. Stracke H, Lindemann A, Federlin K. A benfotiamine-vitamin B combination in treatment of diabetic polyneuropathy. *Exp Clin Endocrinol Diabetes*. 1996;104:311-316.
- 75. Jayabalan B, Low LL. Vitamin B supplementation for diabetic peripheral neuropathy. *Singapore Med J.* 2016;57:55-59.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Additional supporting information may be found online in the Supporting Information section.

How to cite this article: Stein J, Geisel J, Obeid R. Association between neuropathy and B-vitamins: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Eur J Neurol*. 2021;28:2054–2064. <u>https://doi.</u> org/10.1111/ene.14786



Learn more about Dravet Syndrome with a free educational programme

Enrol here

The complete educational programme is now available

Learn more around the rare, severe epilepsy known as Dravet syndrome through video, infographic and clinical article content, which has been guided by an expert steering group.

A certificate of continuing education is available for each module on successful completion of all the multiple-choice questions.

